



Developing | Exemplar Essay

Frankenstein and Bill Nye

Genetic Engineering



Claim and Focus

The essay makes a claim about the texts (“If we let people clone others or bring them back to life, we are giving people too much power over other people’s lives”) but does not connect the claim to the strategies of the texts. The essay focuses more on the texts than the analysis. The writing does not fully address the demands of the prompt.



Analysis and Evidence

The essay relies too heavily on summary and offers only vague analysis to support its claim (“If it helps people, then I think it’s probably okay”). Evidence is not followed up with purposeful analysis. The essay demonstrates very little reasoning (“Bringing people back from the dead doesn’t seem like a good use of power”).



Organization

The essay’s lack of transitions and structure interferes with a full understanding of the writer’s claim, jumping from one idea to the next (“But then there’s Frankenstein”). The essay includes an attempt at an introduction and a concluding statement, but neither are particularly effective (“Too much power from humans causes us to experiment in ways that aren’t good at all”).



Language and Style

The essay does not maintain a formal style throughout (“If it helps people, then I think it’s probably okay”). The essay attempts to vary sentence structure and uses some precise language that is domain-specific at times. The writing addresses the complexity of the topic inconsistently and contains some errors that may interfere with meaning (“Otherwise, how would this author have so details?”).



Using Exemplars in Your Lessons

Exemplar essays are tools to take abstract descriptions and make them more concrete for students. One way to use them is to print the clean copies of the essays and allow students to use the rubric to make notes or even find examples of important elements of an essay - thesis statements, introductions, evidence, conclusions, transitions, etc. Teachers can also use exemplars to illustrate what each score point within a trait ‘looks like’ in an authentic student essay. For additional ideas, please see “25 Ways to Use Exemplar Essays” by visiting the Curriculum Resources page in Help.

Frankenstein and Bill Nye



Notes

Genetic Engineering

Genetic engineering and cloning are very controversial topics. Overall, I do not agree with cloning and genetic engineering. You can not make something that is not there. So many questions and concerns go along with genetic engineering, although cloning is sometimes good and bad depending on what kind it is. Bill Nye the science guy shows that it is good but Frankenstein says that it is bad. If we let people clone others or bring them back to life, we are giving people too much power over other people's lives. Most people aren't able to use this kind of power in good ways so we should not use genetic engineering, even if it seems like there are positive benefits.

The Bill Nye source says there's a benefit to a lot of people, not just a few people, but a lot of people. (The eyes of Nye- Cloning). What if it helps people with sickness? Is this a good kind of power or not? If it helps people, then I think it's probably okay. He says it would be good because a lot of people would be helped, even if some people would disagree with it.

But then there's Frankenstein. This is a fiction but I bet somewhere sometime someone has experimented with bringing dead people to life. Otherwise, how would this author have so details? Bringing people back from the dead doesn't seem like a good use of power. He's trying to make dead people come back alive instead of helping the living people just stay living.

Too much power from humans causes us to experiment in ways that aren't good at all. Even if people want to help other people, we should just leave it alone so someone doesn't take it too far.